



Bonneagar Iompair Éireann
Transport Infrastructure Ireland

TII Publications

GE PE DN CC OP AM RE

Project Appraisal Guidelines Unit 14.0 – Projects (€0.5m to €5m)

PE-PAG-02037
November 2024

About TII

Transport Infrastructure Ireland (TII) is responsible for managing and improving the country's national road and light rail networks.

About TII Publications

TII maintains an online suite of technical publications, which is managed through the TII Publications website. The contents of TII Publications is clearly split into 'Standards' and 'Technical' documentation. All documentation for implementation on TII schemes is collectively referred to as TII Publications (Standards), and all other documentation within the system is collectively referred to as TII Publications (Technical).

Document Attributes

Each document within TII Publications has a range of attributes associated with it, which allows for efficient access and retrieval of the document from the website. These attributes are also contained on the inside cover of each current document, for reference.

TII Publication Title	<i>Project Appraisal Guidelines Unit 14.0 – Projects (€0.5m to €5m)</i>
TII Publication Number	<i>PE-PAG-02037</i>

Activity	<i>Planning & Evaluation (PE)</i>	Document Set	<i>Technical</i>
Stream	<i>Project Appraisal Guidelines (PAG)</i>	Publication Date	<i>November 2024</i>
Document Number	<i>02037</i>	Historical Reference	PAG Unit 14.0

TII Publications Website

This document is part of the TII publications system all of which is available free of charge at <http://www.tiipublications.ie>. For more information on the TII Publications system or to access further TII Publications documentation, please refer to the TII Publications website.

TII Authorisation and Contact Details

This document has been authorised by the Director of Professional Services, Transport Infrastructure Ireland. For any further guidance on the TII Publications system, please contact the following:

Contact: Standards and Research Section, Transport Infrastructure Ireland
Postal Address: Parkgate Business Centre, Parkgate Street, Dublin 8, D08 DK10
Telephone: +353 1 646 3600
Email: infoPUBS@tii.ie

TII Publications



Activity:	Planning & Evaluation (PE)
Stream:	Project Appraisal Guidelines (PAG)
TII Publication Title:	Project Appraisal Guidelines Unit 14.0 – Projects (€0.5m to €5m)
TII Publication Number:	PE-PAG-02037
Publication Date:	November 2024
Set:	Technical

Contents

1. Overview	1
2. Projects (€0.5 to €5m)	2
3. Project Management	3
4. Project Appraisal Documentation.....	4

**Updates to TII Publications resulting in changes to
Project Appraisal Guidelines Unit 14.0 – Projects (€0.5m to €5m) PE-PAG-02037**

Date: February 2017

Page No: Throughout document

Section No: 1, 2, 4.1 and 5.41

Amendment Details:

The principle changes to this document since the October 2016 publication are as follows:

- a) Additional guidance has been included in relation to project types particularly junction upgrades (Sections 1 and 2).
- b) Sections 4.1 and 5.1 have been revised in relation to project appraisal.
- c) The Project Appraisal Balance Sheet for Minor Projects (€0.5m to €5m) attachment to this unit has been revised and is available for download from the Downloads Section of the TII Publications website.

Date: November 2024

Page No:

Section No:

Amendment Details:

Updated to bring into compliance with the TAF (July 2024) and to reflect changes in the PAG and PMG processes in 2024.

Contents Table

1. Overview	1
1.1 Project Complexity & Appraisal Pathways	1
1.2 Relationship with TII Sustainable Implementation Plan Practical Guide	1
2. Projects (€0.5 to €5m)	2
3. Project Management	3
4. Project Appraisal Documentation.....	4
4.1 Appraisal Summary Table - Projects (€0.5m to €5m)	4
4.2 Guidance on Completing the AST	4
4.3 Options Assessment.....	5
4.4 Ex-Post Evaluation	7

1. Overview

In general, TII projects with a capital cost of between €0.5m and €5m are those which are defined under TII Publications DN-GEO-03030¹ (e.g. Road Safety Improvement Schemes, Urban Renewal Scheme, Local Improvement Schemes). Guidance on the appraisal of projects falling under DN-GEO-03030 is provided within this PAG Unit.

For TII projects with a capital cost of between €0.5m and €5m which do not fall under DN-GEO-03030, it is recommended that the guidance in Unit 12.0 – Projects €5m to €30m is also referred to. TII may at their own discretion, apply the guidance in Unit 12 to specific projects with a capital cost less than €5m. At the commencement of the project, the relevant TII Senior Engineering Inspector will determine if the guidance in Unit 12 (or part thereof) applies to a project with a capital cost less than €5m.

1.1 Project Complexity & Appraisal Pathways

The complexity of TII projects varies considerably and this influences the appropriate approach to the appraisal process. For example, a small realignment of a National Road, with a budget in excess of €5m, may not require detailed modelling. Separately a scheme under €5m may include an upgrade of an urban junction for example, which requires detailed modelling and consideration of active travel and public transport impacts.

Taking the above into consideration, the appraisal pathway for TII projects between €0.5m and €5m should be identified at the outset of the project taking into consideration the nature, complexity and geographic location of the project and not solely based on the initial scheme cost estimate.

1.2 Relationship with TII Sustainable Implementation Plan Practical Guide

In parallel to the TII PAG/PMG, TII has also produced the Guide to the Implementation of Sustainability for TII Projects², which provides practical advice for project managers on how to better deliver projects from a sustainability perspective during Phases 0-7.

This guide aims to prompt a sustainability review at the start of each TII project phase through a series of 'workflow' spreadsheets which project managers should complete to ensure sustainability concepts are integrated into their approach. Furthermore, this guidance provides valuable advice on the best use of public consultation in projects and the need for the baseline review.

However, it should be noted that this guide only has an advisory role in the PAG/PMG processes to improve the delivery of projects from a sustainability perspective. The 'workflows' in the guide should be regarded as a project management tool to help integrate sustainability into projects at each phase, but the output spreadsheets from the workflows do not need to be included in the PAG deliverables.

¹ Design Phase Procedure for Road Safety Improvement Schemes, Urban Renewal Schemes and Local Improvement Schemes

² [GE-GEN-01101 \(tiipublications.ie\)](https://www.tiipublications.ie/GE-GEN-01101)

2. Projects (€0.5 to €5m)

In most cases, TII capital projects between €0.5m and €5m will be categorised within DN-GEO-03030. These capital projects generally encompass the following:

- Road Safety Improvement Schemes (RSIS) that have already been approved at Feasibility and Options Stage of TII Publications (Standards) GE-STY-01037³.
- Urban Renewal Schemes (URS) i.e. schemes that are designed in accordance with The Design Manual for Urban Roads and Streets (DMURS).
- Road Safety Improvement aspects (i.e. design elements) of Pavement Asset Repair and Renewal (PARR) Schemes. TII Publications (Standards) AM-PAV-06049⁴.
- Local Improvement Schemes (LIS) e.g. local authority general improvement schemes which have not been identified as Road Safety Improvement Schemes, schemes led, funded or partly funded by other agencies, development led schemes and/or community schemes.

Maintenance schemes do not fall under DN-GEO-03030. Maintenance schemes predominantly involve pavement works and other road feature pavement works. These schemes fall under current expenditure and are supported by the TII Pavement Management System (PMS). The PMS includes an appraisal of such expenditure at programme level based on lifecycle analysis.

A capital project (e.g. removal of a sub-standard bend) may form part of a Maintenance Scheme. Where this is the case the capital project element needs to be appraised in accordance with this PAG Unit.

Projects (€0.5m to €5m) may also encompass junction improvements or active travel projects in either rural or urban environments. These projects should consider the guidance in Unit 12.0 – Projects €5m to €30m.

³ [GE-STY-01037](#)

⁴ [AM-PAV-06049](#)

3. Project Management

The appraisal methodology outlined hereunder is designed to take account of the principles of proportionality, in which the level of resources invested into appraisal matches the scale and complexity of the proposal.

For projects (€0.5m to €5m) appraisal should be proportional to the scale and likely impact of the project being proposed. For this purpose, an Appraisal Summary Table (AST) has been developed incorporating a Multi Criteria Analysis (MCA) summary of the key impacts of the proposal and is deemed to fulfil the appraisal requirements of such projects.

As outlined in the Department of Transport (DoT) Transport Appraisal Framework (TAF) for projects where none of the shortlisted options cost more than €30m, an MCA should be used as the primary tool for the detailed impact assessment and economic appraisal.

The AST should be appended to / accompany the Design Report at Phase 3 (Design and Environmental Evaluation).

4. Project Appraisal Documentation

4.1 Appraisal Summary Table - Projects (€0.5m to €5m)

At PMG Phase 3 (Design and Environmental Evaluation) an AST should be completed with any relevant attachments. This form serves as a Business Case, at a level of detail appropriate to the scale of Projects (€0.5m to €5m) which fall under DN-GEO-03030.

Within the AST, each project will be assessed against the Government's seven key appraisal criteria as set out within the TAF. These appraisal criteria are as follows:

- Economy – Transport User Benefits and Wider Economic Impacts
- Accessibility Impacts
- Social Impacts
- Land Use Impacts
- Safety Impacts
- Climate Change Impacts
- Local Environmental Impacts

A set of project objectives should be defined for each applicable criteria based on the need for the scheme and the known constraints. The AST provides a concise summary of the merits of the preferred option and a measure of its likelihood of meeting the appraisal objectives outlined above, based on a MCA assessment.

The AST aims to present the totality of the impact of the project at Phase 3 (Design and Environmental Evaluation) through the provision of short qualitative statements describing each impact across each objective. Given the scale of relevant projects and low levels of capital investment, monetary values or quantitative indicators are not considered necessary.

In light of the fact that most impacts are unquantifiable, each impact is scored on a scale of 1 (major or highly negative) to 7 (major or highly positive), with a score of 4 representing a neutral or minimal impact. The integer score to be assigned according to the scale of impact is as follows:

- 1 - Major or highly negative
- 2 - Moderately negative
- 3 - Minor or slightly negative
- 4 - Not significant or neutral
- 5 - Minor or slightly positive
- 6 - Moderately positive
- 7 - Major or highly positive

4.2 Guidance on Completing the AST

A sample AST table is shown in Table 14.0.1. The header identifies clearly the option that is being appraised, notes the budget cost of the project (in current prices), and summarises the issues and opportunities that the proposal intends to address.

The seven appraisal criteria are divided into sub-criteria. The table includes criteria in TAF and additional sub-criteria relevant to TII. The proposed project option is assessed against each one of the applicable criteria with qualitative statements and sub-criteria performance description and scoring include in the AST. An appraisal criteria score for each appraisal criteria and for the overall scheme is also required.

The MCA should be undertaken as per the guidance set out in PAG Unit 7.0 – Multi-Criteria Analysis. The AST is provided as a word template and criteria/sub-criteria which are not relevant to the scheme under consideration can be removed to keep the table concise

4.3 Options Assessment

The examination and assessment of feasible options that meet the objectives of a project is a key element of the appraisal process for all projects, regardless of scale or value. An overview of this process is outlined in detail in PAG Unit 4.0 – Options Report.

While TII Projects valued between €0.5m and €5m do not require the same level of reporting and formal appraisal deliverables as projects valued in excess of €5m, the process of options assessment and the selection of the preferred option should be documented by the project team (e.g. as part of the Feasibility and Options Phases of GE-STY-01037) and available for review where required. The MCA process and AST template may be useful in the assessment of all options considered for a project.

Table 14.01 Appraisal Summary Table (Template)

PAG Unit 14 - Appraisal Summary Table for Projects (€0.5m to €5m) as defined by DN-GEO-03030							
Scheme Name:		Description:	Issues/Opportunities Identified:				
Current Typical Carriageway Width:		Proposed Carriageway Standard:	Route No.:	Speed Limit:	Total Scheme Budget (€m):		
Appraisal Criteria	Appraisal Sub-Criteria	Objectives	Qualitative Statement:		Sub-criteria Performance Description	Sub-criteria Score	Appraisal Criteria Score
Climate Change	Climate Change Impacts						
	Climate Adaption						
Environment	Agricultural Impacts						
	Non-Agricultural Property Impacts						
	Air Quality						
	Noise and vibration						
	Waste						
	Biodiversity						
	Architectural Heritage						
	Archaeological & Cultural Heritage						
	Landscape and Visual						
	Solis and Geology						
	Hydrology						
Hydrogeology							
Economy	Travel Time						
	Transport Costs						
	Journey Time Reliability						
	Journey Quality						
	Change in Land-Use Value						
	Wider Economic Benefits						
	Funding Requirements						
Accessibility	Access to Key Services						
	Access to Recreational Facilities						
	Access to Jobs						
	Access to International Gateways						
	Freight Access						
	Regional Balance						
Social	Socially Disadvantaged Geographical Areas						
	Vulnerable User Groups						
Land Use	Agricultural Impacts						
	Non-Agricultural Property Impacts						
	Change in Quality of Public Realm						
	Existing Transport Network and Service Impact						
	Zoned Land, Land Use Planning and Spatial Planning						
Safety	Collision Reduction						
	Other Safety Impacts						
Overall Appraisal Score of Scheme:							

4.4 Ex-Post Evaluation

Subsequent to the approval of the AST by the Sponsoring Agency, the project can proceed to tendering.

Following project completion, the outturn cost should be submitted to TII, in order to provide feedback on construction costs. TII will at this stage decide whether an Ex-Post Evaluation should be carried out on the project in accordance with TAF. This exercise is carried out on a sample of completed projects to identify any lessons learnt that would enhance future decision-making.



 Ionad Ghnó Gheata na Páirce,
Stráid Gheata na Páirce,
Baile Átha Cliath 8, D08 DK10, Éire

 Parkgate Business Centre,
Parkgate Street,
Dublin 8, D08 DK10, Ireland

 www.tii.ie

 info@tii.ie

 +353 (01) 646 3600

 +353 (01) 646 3601